

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF NORTHVILLE
PLANNING COMMISSION
January 26, 2021**

DATE: January 26, 2021

APPROVED: February 23, 2021

TIME: 7:00 PM

PLACE: Meeting held remotely via video/teleconference

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chair Zawodny at 7:03 p.m. via Zoom video conference meeting, in compliance with the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.261, *ET SEQ.*, AS AMENDED. Members of the public body and members of the public participating electronically were considered present at the meeting and could participate as if physically present. Planning Commission members identified their location during roll call, as required.

ROLL CALL:

Present: Timothy Guerriero, Bonita Springs, Lee County, FL
Mindy Herrmann, Northville Township, Wayne County, MI
George McCarthy, Northville Township, Wayne County, MI
Jayne Watson, Northville Township, Wayne County, MI
Gary Yang, Northville Township, Wayne County, MI
Tim Zawodny, Northville Township, Wayne County, MI

Excused: Eric Lark

Staff: Jennifer Frey, Township Planner
Robert Belair, Director of Public Services

Approval of Minutes:

Planning Commission – December 8, 2020

MOTION by McCarthy, support by Guerriero, to approve the December 8, 2020 Planning Commission meeting minutes as presented.

Roll call vote: Ayes: Guerriero, Herrmann
n, McCarthy, Watson, Yang, Zawodny

Nays: None

Motion approved 6-0

Correspondence:

Correspondence had been received relative to Agenda Item #2:

- January 26, 2021 response letter from the applicant, Dr. Zakaria
- January 26, 2021 Letter from Fire Marshal Hughes

3. The gable siding material is not specified and excluded from the cement board siding calculation. The gable siding material shall be clarified; vinyl siding is not permitted.
4. The specific building materials (name/manufacturer, color) shall be identified on the elevation sheet. Brick and stone products shall be specified and identified as full dimension brick and stone. This is in addition to the building material percentages table.
5. There is a discrepancy between the sample board and the colored elevation for the color of the siding and the garage doors. Desert tan and kilim beige are shown on the sample board and dark grey/blue siding and white garage doors are shown in the color elevation. The colored elevation trim package appears to be the same as the units in Novi.
6. An electronic sample board will be available for the meeting. A material sample board was dropped off at the Township prior to tonight's meeting.

As noted in the Lighting Consultant's January 19, 2021 letter, Per Section 170-21.5.3 and 170-21.5.8 of the Zoning Ordinance, the full part number of the proposed luminaire must be submitted in the photometric plan, including the manufacturer, model number, lamp type, lumen output, wattage, number of heads, color temperature, and IES number used for calculations.

Any approving motion should be conditioned on correcting and adding notations as identified in Township Planner Frey's letter. The Planning Commission should discuss the requested building material percentages, and also weigh in on what the Commission feels should be a desired color palette for the garage siding and doors.

Michael Noles, Umlor Group, 49287 West Road, Wixom MI, was present on behalf of this application by Pulte Homes for site plan approval. Joe Skore, Pulte Group, was also present.

Utilizing a PowerPoint presentation, Mr. Noles made the following points:

- The site consisted of 3 parcels, with a total area of 11.32 acres, and zoned RM-1 Multi-family use. The Future Land Use Map showed this area as being low density multi-family.
- The project would have 48 units, with 4.94 Du/Ac.
- All units would have fire suppression.
- They would resolve the outstanding lighting issues with Stantec lighting.
- Per the Progressive/ae traffic report, traffic will not be perceptibly affected by the development.
- The project features over 2 acres of open space, 120 parking spaces, significant natural features with wetlands and woodlands protection, pedestrian connectivity with sidewalks on both sides and frontage, and 50' landscape buffers with landscaping/preservation.
- There were areas of open space that could not be counted in the calculation; the effective open space was 7.10 acres.
- The road meandered to give every home as much a buffer as possible.
- Schafer Development had two meetings with the Homeowners' Association to the

north. The plan presented this evening was the plan most supported by the Homeowners' Association, due to the open spaces provided.

- An electronic material and color board was provided, showing the tan siding, the dark shingles, and the white trim colors.
- Regarding material percentages, brick and stone would be 85.4% on the front elevation, with shake siding in the gables being 14.6%.
- The rear elevations have 100% masonry, a combination of 45% cement siding on the second floor elevation, with 55% brick to the belt. The applicants were asking for approval for the percentage and location of the cement siding.
- During the conditional rezoning conversations in 2020, the Commission had asked Pulte to take a look at units #1 and #48, which would face Haggerty Road, to see if there was any way to spruce those up. Pulte has agreed to include optional windows on those side elevation for those two units.
- For the side units, cement siding on the second floor would be 52%, with brick to the belt 48%. Again, Pulte was asking for approval for the cement siding.
- Landscape amenities included 61 street trees, 75 woodland replacement trees, 15 general trees, 15 basin trees, and 173 preserved trees, along with hundreds of shrubs, diverse plantings, birdhouses and butterfly gardens.
- The streetscape would include mail kiosks and decorative street lights.

Mr. Noles completed his presentation.

In response to questions from the Commission, Mr. Noles explained that a pathways/sidewalk connection was not made with the neighboring communities because the neighbors opposed that connection. Township Planner Frey further explained that no secondary vehicular access was provided either, because the neighbors did not want that. Subsequently fire suppression was added to each unit.

In response to questions from Chair Zawodny, Mr. Noles explained that the 85.4% masonry calculation only applied to the front elevations. Side elevations included the ends of the buildings, and also the sides of those portions of the units that were jogged out and visible from the side. The interior corridor leading to a front door was not included in the side elevation. However, if that small area was added to the side elevation, the percentage changes would be very small; they would not dilute the percentages as stated this evening.

Mr. Noles pointed out that brick is masonry and cement siding is also considered a masonry product, resulting in close to a 100% masonry front elevation being provided. The Township's ordinance defined masonry as brick, stone, or cement siding.

Chair Zawodny advised that the cement siding was not usually counted toward the 80% masonry requirement. Township Planner Frey agreed, The ordinance required 80% brick on each elevation, with the remaining 20% permitted to be other masonry products, such as limestone, granite, marble, precast stone or cement board siding. Cement board siding was considered a secondary product. The Planning Commission did have authority to revise the percentages on a case by case basis.

Chair Zawodny concluded that the Commission was being asked to consider waiving the 80% requirement for the side and rear elevations.

Discussion followed:

- Other multi-family developments in the Township used more masonry than this proposal, including the townhomes at Village of Northville, Cedarbrook, and others.
- The front elevations provided attractive relief in the planes of the building.
- The Commission could accept less brick on the rear, as this development had no rear-to-rear configurations, and the backs of the buildings faced open space. However, they would like to see the brick go up at least to the gable on the end walls of the building.
- Chair Zawodny asked if the end elevations have the same soffit as shown in the Novi development photographs, that runs across the bottom of the gable, with a small shingled area above that, with the projection coming out of the wall? Mr. Noles said the side elevations would have those features.
- The garage doors would be beige, with a white trim.
- Mr. Noles said the materials would be Glen-Gery brick, Brampton stone, Allura cement siding, wood trim, Sherwin Williams paint, and CertainTeed shingles. This information was being included in a response letter being sent to the Planning Department tomorrow.
- The colors would be different than those shown at the Novi development, with this project using more neutral colors, and the garage doors being Kilim Beige, as already noted.

In response to a question from Commissioner Herrmann, Township Planner Frey said the 80%/20% masonry rule had been developed several years ago to provide an aesthetic standard of timeless appeal within the Township, while giving the Planning Commission flexibility to look at each building design on a case by case basis. Specifically the Commission had wanted to prohibit EIFS, a cementous product that does not hold up well, and also wanted to avoid elevations that had large expanses of block.

In the present case, Mr. Noles said the side elevations would be rarely seen from the road, except for units #1 and #48, and would not be seen from the rear. The other side elevations would have significant landscaping buffering their appearance.

Chair Zawodny asked if the wood trim would be cedar. Mr. Noles said the trim material was non-specified, but he could find out what was being used and put it in the response letter. In any event the trim would not be wood-wrapped, but would be painted or stained to match the small pieces of wood on the front elements. All soffits and undersides would be wood.

Chair Zawodny opened the meeting to public comment.

Suzette Husted Heathcote, 49744 Parkside Drive, asked when first occupancy was anticipated.

Mr. Noles said they were hoping for a July groundbreaking, paving in October, with sales to start in late fall 2021 or early spring 2022. First move-ins would be approximately June 2022. The anticipate demand would be high for this 48-unit site.

Chair Zawodny asked for size and anticipated price point for these units. Mr. Skore said the units would be approximately 1850-1950 square feet with options, and would have base pricing in the mid-300's, with premium upgrades bringing cost up to the \$400,000 range.

The Commission discussed the configuration of the units on the site, and agreed that the side elevations would not be too visible, except for units #1 and #48 as already discussed. Again, there were no rear-to-rear units. However, Commissioner Watson did not support waiving the 80% masonry requirement on the side elevations in general. Other Commissioners also supported complying with the 80% standard on the sides. Complying with that requirement would result in a much stronger product. While Commissioners were sensitive to cost concerns, they also understood that following the ordinance added value.

Chair Zawodny agreed, noting that landscaping on the site would take time to mature. The Commission needed to be consistent with developments already in the Township, and the level of finish and delivery the Commission was trying to provide.

After further discussion, Mr. Noles and Mr. Skole agreed to provide brick on all the side elevations, up to the second floor ceiling, and the Commission agreed with the proposed percentages for the rear, especially because the rear faced out to wooded areas, with no rear-to-rear configurations.

Township Planner Frey summarized the proposed modifications agreed to this evening:

- Side elevations: brick on the 1st and 2nd floor up to the 2nd floor ceiling, with siding in the gabled ends on each of the units. This change likely brought the side elevations into ordinance conformance.
- Rear unit percentages acceptable (55% brick, 45% cement siding), because of their relationship to woodlands, open space, and no rear-to-rear configurations.
- Front elevations: acceptable as presented.

In response to a question from Township Planner Frey, Mr. Skore said Pulte had not previously used this color palette in Michigan.

Chair Zawodny emphasized the importance of the applicants providing a final color board/material board. He was interested in how Lillian Beige looked next to the other colors, particularly because Killian Beige was a color he had experience with; it carried a slight pink rose tint.

Chair Zawodny indicated he was ready for a motion.

Commissioner Guerriero said he supported the changes agreed to this evening. He thought Pulte had done a wonderful job with the front elevations, and had shown

willingness this evening to work with the Township and Commission to deliver an agreed-upon product.

MOTION by Guerriero, support by McCarthy, in the matter of PSPR20-0006, Paul Schyck, Pulte Group, that the Planning Commission approve the site plan for Northville Glades, a 48-unit townhome multi-family development, for the location as described on the west side of Haggerty Road between 5 and 6 Mile Roads, with the following conditions:

- Compliance with all the issues called out in Township Planner Frey's January 21, 2021 letter.
- Submission of revised drawings to show a full brick siding up to the 2nd floor ceiling, with the gables being cement siding, on all end elevations of the eight buildings in the development, in accordance with the materials and color schemes presented this evening.
- 55% percentage masonry for the rear elevations be approved as requested, with the secondary materials and design for the rear elevations as described this evening.
- Submission of a revised material and color board to include the paint color Killian Beige.
- To include the final agreement with the Fire Department and resolution of outstanding lighting issues, with administrative review and approval.

Roll call vote: Ayes: Guerriero, Herrmann, McCarthy, Watson, Yang, Zawodny
Nays: None

Motion approved 6-0.

2. PSPR20-0007	Site Plan
Representative:	Samir Zakaria
Owner:	Amelia Johnson Trust - Andrew
Location:	18800 Northville Rd.
Request:	Construct a new, single story medical office building
Action:	Approve, Approve with Conditions, Postpone, or Deny

Township Planner Frey noted that review comments from the Township Engineer, Fire Department and Lighting Engineer were provided separately; the Traffic Engineer did not have any review comments to address.

Referring to her January 7, 2021 memorandum, Township Planner Frey gave the following information:

The project is located at 18800 Northville Road, between 6 and 7 Mile Roads, and proposes a 6,300 square foot medical office building with associated parking, landscape and other site improvements. The property is zoned B-3 where offices are a permitted land use. The primary tenant will be Dr. Zakaria's dental practice.

The site currently consists of two lots containing older homes. The plan is to demolish the homes and combine the lots.

Outstanding issues included:

- The proposed medical office requires 27 parking spaces; 33 are provided. Six parking spaces should be eliminated or, at the discretion of the Planning Commission, additional parking spaces may be approved if the applicant can demonstrate the need for the additional parking. Without a demonstrated need for additional parking, the ordinance requirement shall be followed.
- The foundation planting area in front of the building is required to be 8' deep; 5.83' is provided at the widest point. The Planning Commission may approve a reduced amount based on a finding that dimensional conditions unique to the parcel prevent providing the full 8'. The planting beds as shown can accommodate plant material that meets the intent of the foundation planting requirement.
- A minimum 80% brick (excluding roof and window areas) is required for each facade. The percentages for each building material and windows areas on each side of the building must be provided on the elevation sheet. The Planning Commission may approve alternative percentages on a project by project basis provided it is determined that the application of alternatives are consistent with the intent and purpose of the ordinance. The applicant was asking that their combination of brick, stone and block be approved.

One outstanding lighting issue regarding the requirement for emergency lighting luminaires also needed to be resolved.

Communication had been received today from the Fire Marshal providing a response to the applicant's comments in a letter, also received today, regarding placement of a fire hydrant and/or fire suppression on the site. Based on an existing hydrant being located close to this site, the Fire Marshal was recommending an on-site hydrant plus the use of the existing hydrant on the west side of Northville Road, if that hydrant was identified on the plan. If the building was sprinklered the applicants could potentially eliminate the on-site hydrant.

Dr. Samir Zakaria was present on behalf of this application for site plan review. Ghassan Abdenour, architect, was also present.

Dr. Zakaria introduced himself and his practice and thanked the Township for their help in preparing for this application.

Mr. Abdenour made the following points:

- They were proposing a 6,200 square foot building as already noted, with two suites: one for Dr. Zakaria for surgical dentistry, and one for a dermatology practice.
- They were requesting approval of building materials as submitted, including percentage of masonry on the four elevations. They were proposing 100% masonry on the front elevation, utilizing brick, natural stone, limestone, and split face block with a limestone appearance at the bottom. The brick is a darker color, but everything else comes close to same light-toned color as shown on the materials board.

- As shown on the elevations, gables were created for the front and side elevations.
- They were requesting a deviation from the 8 foot requirement for the front foundation landscaping area. They would be able to provide all the required materials in the almost 6 foot width as shown. The lot has a shallow depth.
- The outstanding issue for the lighting pertained to exit door lighting, and could easily be resolved.
- The applicants would work with Fire Department regarding the requirement for fire hydrants.
- Regarding the parking, they were providing 33 spaces when 27 were required. Two medical suites were proposed. Dr. Zacharia's practice required 14-16 nursing staff. There needed to be enough parking for nurses, patients, and also for the proposed dermatology practice.
- A note would be placed on the plans verifying that the trees do not interfere with the underground utility.

The applicants responded to further questions from the Commission:

- The standing span metal roof component would be a champagne or dark bronze color, to blend with the dark gray roof and the dark bronze windows.
- The block base material on the elevations that wasn't shown on the materials board would be a veneer.
- The applicants reviewed the building materials with the Commission in detail.
- Cast stone, not split faced block, would be used where so labeled.
- The materials over the door entrances on the front elevation would be limestone.

Chair Zawodny asked if any alternatives had been explored so that the front foundation plantings could conform to the 8' requirement. Township Planner Frey said that they had discussed eliminating the 2 foot landscape strip in the back, but for safety reasons the applicants wanted to include that strip, so that the rear doors did not open right into the drive lane. The applicants had worked with the Township to modify the widths of the drive and the depths of the parking spaces on the perimeter, reducing impervious surface as much as possible.

Commissioner Guerriero said that the proposed site plan appeared to be a great use for the site, and would improve this portion of Northville Road. The façade materials were robust and substantial, and met the intent of the ordinance. Regarding the request for 6 extra parking spaces, the applicant knew his business best in terms of parking requirements. The additional 6 spaces do not detract from the plan or the overall aesthetics of the site.

Chair Zawodny agreed that the materials were appropriate. The applicants had also demonstrated that the site could handle the parking as shown. Landbanking six spaces and then constructing them later would be very disruptive to the business operations in this building, and was not recommended. He also agreed that this building would improve the appearance of this section of Northville Road.

Township Planner Frey acknowledged a chat comment on the Zoom screen by Suzette Husted Heathcote: *An exciting update to Northville Township.*

MOTION by McCarthy, support by Guerriero, in the matter of PSPR20-0007, 18800 Northville Road, owner Samir Zakaria, that the Planning Commission approve the Site Plan for a new single story medical office building as submitted, with the following conditions:

- Any outstanding issues called out in Township Planner Frey’s January 7, 2021 letter be resolved.
- Any outstanding issues with the Fire Marshal be resolved, particularly in regards to fire hydrant requirement and placement.
- Photometric plan be submitted showing resolution of lighting issue called out in the January 19, 2021 Stantec review letter, to be approved administratively.

Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Guerriero, Herrmann, McCarthy, Watson, Yang, Zawodny

Nays: None.

Motion approved 6-0.

- | | |
|-------------------------|---|
| 3. PSKPRO20-0004 | Sketch Plan |
| Representative: | Tony Jaafar |
| Owner: | N&R Pastor, LLC – Three Generations |
| Location: | 20426 Haggerty Rd. |
| Request: | 2 nd Sign Wall Sign |
| Action: | Approve, Approve with Conditions, Postpone, or Deny |

Referring to her January 15, 2021 memorandum, Township Planner Frey gave the review for this request to approve a sketch plan showing a 2nd wall sign at 20426 Haggerty Road in the Three Generations Plaza.

The Livonia Cigar Bar was located adjacent to Mission Barbecue, just south of Hampton Inn. One sign would be over the front entry facing the parking lot with another sign located on the back of the building facing Haggerty Road. The Planning Commission had the ability to approve a second non-residential sign when it was oriented in such a way that more than one side of the building can be seen from a road, provided that the sign is less than 60% of the maximum sign area allowed or each sign is no greater than 80% of the size permitted for the sign district in which it is located; both of the signs met this requirement.

Mission Barbecue had previously been granted a second sign.

Tony Jaafar, 20426 Haggerty Road, was present on behalf of this request for two signs. He explained the need for a sign facing the Hampton Hotel as well as one on the rear facing Haggerty Road.

In response to discussion, Township Planner Frey said the request did not distinguish between primary and secondary signs, as there was no sign up right now. Both requested signs met the 80% size requirement.

In response to a question from Commissioner Guerriero, Mr. Jaafar explained that his business had started in Northville as *Smoky's of Northville*, but had since moved to Livonia. Now that they were returning to Northville, they were keeping the Livonia name, though their d/b/a remained Smoky's of Northville.

Commissioner Guerriero said this request clearly fit into the rationale for an exception to the one-sign requirement, as the business fronted on two very busy roads, and especially because of the location off of Haggerty placed the business in a valley not actually fronting on Haggerty. Commissioner McCarthy agreed, noting that while he usually opposed granting more than one sign, this particular location warranted two signs. Commission Watson also agreed, saying that there was nothing detrimental about the second sign location, especially given the placement of the business along Haggerty Road.

Chair Zawodny also agreed the request was justified, and confirmed with Township Planner Frey that all dimensional and other sign requirements had been reviewed for compliance.

MOTION by Guerriero, support by McCarthy, in the matter of PSKPRO20-0004, Sketch Plan, 20426 Haggerty Road, 2nd Sign Wall Sign, for the Livonia Cigar Bar, that the Planning Commission approve the application as submitted.

Roll call vote: Ayes: Guerriero, Herrmann, McCarthy, Watson, Yang, Zawodny

Nays: None

Motion approved 6-0.

Other Business: Election of Officers for 2021.

Commissioner Watson nominated Tim Zawodny as Chair.
Chair Zawodny nominated Jayne Watson as Vice Chair.
Commissioner Guerriero nominated Eric Lark as Secretary.

MOTION by Guerriero, support by Yang, to elect the following slate of officers for 2021:

Tim Zawodny, Chair
Jayne Watson, Vice Chair
Eric Lark, Secretary

Roll call vote: Ayes: Guerriero, Herrmann, McCarthy, Watson, Yang, Zawodny

Nays: None

Motion approved 6-0.

Department Reports:

Jennifer Frey, Township Planner

- Welcome Gary Yang to the Planning Commission.
- Chick-fil-A official opening on Thursday January 28.
- ZBA met last week and approved a fence variance in the front yard for Little Seeds Daycare, located on 8 Mile Road near Napier. Little Seeds has a nonconforming site with nonconforming setbacks, and they were seeking to enclose the front yard in order to provide safety to their playground area along 8 Mile Road.

Mindy Herrmann, Board of Trustees

- Supervisor Abbo has initiated steering committees for Legacy Park & Pathways; he was also seeking to have a joint meeting between the Planning Commission and Board of Trustees to discuss common goals and concerns.

Extended Public Comments:

None.

Adjournment:

Motion by McCarthy, support by Guerriero, to adjourn the meeting at 9:22 pm.

Voice vote: Unanimous

Motion approved 6-0.